

#### **Records of Meetings**

Year: 2020

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Review Panel.

Signed

Senator Kristina Moore

Chair

Future Hospital Review Panel

### **Record of Meeting**

Date: 23rd January 2020

| Present       | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair       |
|---------------|-------------------------------------|
|               | Connétable Mike Jackson, Vice-Chair |
|               | Deputy Kirsten Morel                |
|               | Deputy Rob Ward                     |
| Apologies     | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat              |
|               | Senator Sarah Ferguson              |
| Absent        |                                     |
| In attendance | Sammy McKee, Scrutiny Officer       |

| Agenda matter  |          |
|--|----------|
| 1. Records of Meetings   |          |
| The Panel approved the minutes of the meetings held on 18th October (public and private) and 3rd December 2019.  |          |
| 2. Actions   |          |
| The Panel noted that various documents had been provided by the 'Our Hospital' Political Oversight Group (POG) following its last meeting and consideration was given to whether any further action was needed.  |          |
| The Panel agreed to draft a letter to the Chair of POG, Senator Farnham, asking for further clarity with regard to the selection process for members of the Citizen's Panel and to follow up on the request from the Panel to observe its meetings. It further agreed      | SM       |
| to draft a number of questions to the Minister for the Environment with respect to a recent written question asked by the Connétable of St Brelade in the States Assembly regarding planning guidance for the new hospital and the public interest test.                   | SM       |
| 3. Government's Update Report to the States Assembly   |          |
| The Officer advised the Panel that it had not yet received confirmation of when the next update on the 'Our Hospital' Project would be presented to the States Assembly by the Chair of POG. The Officer was requested to follow up on this matter.                        | SM       |
| 4. Public Hearing with Chair of POG  |          |
| The Panel noted that it was due to receive Senator Farnham for a Public Hearing at 2pm on Thursday 6th February.   |          |
| The Panel considered areas of questioning for its Public Hearing. The Officer was requested to draft a question plan and circulate it to the Panel. The Officer was also requested to liaise with the Panel to identify a date and time for a hearing preparation meeting. | SM<br>SM |
| 5. Jersey Care Model   |          |
| The Panel agreed that it would be beneficial to have a member of the Health and Social Security Panel (HSSP) present at every meeting in order to give an update on the progress of the Review of the Jersey Care Model. It was further agreed, therefore, that            |          |

| in the case where Deputy Le Hegarat was unable to attend a Review Panel meeting, the Vice-Chair of HSSP would be invited to attend in her place. |  |
|--|--|
| 6. Next meeting  |  |
| The Panel is yet to decide its next meeting date.  |  |

## **Record of Meeting**

Date: 2nd March 2020

| Present       | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair<br>Connétable Mike Jackson, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Mary Le Hegarat<br>Deputy Kirsten Morel<br>Deputy Rob Ward  |
|---------------|--|
| Apologies     | Senator Sarah Ferguson   |
| Absent        |  |
| In attendance | Senator L. Farnham, Deputy Chief Minister and Chair of the 'Our Hospital' Political Oversight Group Deputy H. Raymond, Assistant Chief Minister Caroline Langdon, Director General, Health and Community Services Richard Bannister, Interim Project Director for 'Our Hospital' Project Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Scrutiny Officer |

| Agenda matter   |  |
|---|--|
| 1. Public Hearing   |  |
| The Review Panel received the Deputy Chief Minister, Senator Farnham, Assistant Chief Minister, Deputy Raymond, Caroline Langdon, Director General of Health and Community Services and Richard Bannister, Interim Project Director of the 'Our Hospital' Project for a Public Hearing. A transcript was made of the proceedings and would be available to view on the States Assembly website. |  |

#### **Record of Meeting**

#### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 17th April 2020

| Present       | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair<br>Connetable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Mary Le Hegarat<br>Senator Sarah Ferguson  |
|---------------|--|
|               | Deputy Kirsten Morel   |
| Apologies     |  |
| Absent        | Deputy Robert Ward   |
| In attendance | Deputy Hugh Raymond, Assistant Minister for Health and Social Services Senator Lyndon Farnham, Deputy Chief Minister Charlie Parker, Chief Executive Officer Caroline Landon, Director General for Health and Community Services Richard Bannister, Interim Project Director Ruth Johnson, Director Social Policy, Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance Tracy Mourant, Private Secretary to the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture Sarah Bisson, Jersey Practice Model Lead Officer, Education Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter  |  |
|--|--|
| 1. Briefing – Future Hospital Design and Delivery Partner and the impact of Covid-19   |  |
| This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.  |  |
| The Panel received a private briefing and slide presentation from the Assistant Minister for Health and Social Services ('the Assistant Minister') and officers regarding the impact of Covid-19 on the procurement process for a Design and Delivery Partner for the Future Hospital. Following the briefing, the Panel agreed it should submit written follow-up questions to the Deputy Chief Minister, in particular seeking clarification on when the information it had received in today's briefing would be made public. |  |

#### **Record of Meeting**

#### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 18th May 2020

| Present       | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair (absent for Item 1) Connetable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair Deputy Robert Ward (absent for Item 2) Deputy Mary Le Hegarat Deputy Kirsten Morel Senator Sarah Ferguson   |
|---------------|--|
| Apologies     |  |
| Absent        |  |
| In attendance | Caro Tomlinson, Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer  Item 2 only: Deputy John Young, Minister for the Environment Deputy Gregory Guida, Assistant Minister for the Environment Andrew Scate, Director General of Growth, Housing and Environment Kevin Pilley, Head of Place and Spatial Planning, Planning and Environment Ben Markwell-Sales, Private Secretary to the Minister for the Environment |

| Agenda matter  | Action |
|--|--------|
| 1. Minutes   |        |
| The private and public minutes of the meeting of 7th May 2020 were approved.   |        |
| 2. Briefing – Future Hospital Planning and the impact of Covid-19  |        |
| The Review Panel welcomed the Minister for the Environment and members of his team to discuss the potential impact of Covid-19 on Future Hospital planning.  |        |
| The Review Panel noted that a Supplementary Planning Guidance document had been published earlier in May 2020, specifically relating to the Our Hospital project, including key planning considerations, matters of process and decision-making procedures. The Review Panel noted that the Chair of the Our Hospital Political Oversight Group (OH POG) had requested advice on the planning process to be applied, and issues that should be covered when the project team put together its development proposals and planning application. The Minister for the Environment explained that, mindful that the previous planning applications for the future hospital had been rejected, he had wanted to produce a public document so the planning process could be as transparent as possible. He advised that, following the last unsuccessful planning application, the Planning Inspector had concluded that |        |
| 'community considerations' should be resolved before the next application was submitted. These included the health needs of the Island residents, the 'buy-in' of clinicians to the future Hospital plans, and general agreement as to what facilities and services would be included in the building.   |        |

The Minister for the Environment told the Panel that he agreed that the proposed development of a new hospital would likely have a significant effect on the interests of much of the community and that he would therefore require that a public inquiry into any proposal for a new hospital was held. This would involve the appointment of an independent Planning Inspector who would consider the issues associated with any planning application, including representations made in respect of it, at a public hearing, and who would then submit a report to the Minister to enable him to determine the application. When asked how long the public enquiry might take, he advised that if he were to be given advance notice of the submission of the planning application, this might speed up the process, for example giving him the ability to appoint a Planning Inspector. However, he advised that, based on previous planning applications, and the impact of Covid-19 slowing the process further, the submission and decision-making process could take up to nine months.

The Minister for the Environment further advised that he did not know when a decision would be made on the site selection for the new Hospital but that the Supplementary Guidance directed how it could be deemed an exception to the Island Plan, if necessary. The Minister confirmed that there was a cap of approximately £230,000 on the cost of large planning applications.

The Review Panel asked how potential conflicts of interest could be resolved within the current organisational structure of the Growth Housing and Environment department, whereby the Director General who would oversee, and have ultimate responsibility for, the planning application of the Hospital on behalf of the applicant, was also Group Director of Regulation, responsible for overseeing regulatory requirements of such planning applications. The Director General advised he would not be involved in any detailed discussions specific to the Hospital build. The Review Panel agreed he would withdraw from the meeting if such specific discussions took place in this forum. It then went on to commence discussion of potential parking and drop-off provisions for the future hospital and the Director General was asked to leave the meeting.

The Review Panel agreed it would ask more detailed questions on planning specifications of the hospital build at a later date and thanked the Minister and his team for its briefing, who then left the meeting.

The Review Panel agreed to request the Minister for the Environment to provide detailed costs of the Planning Inspector and public enquiries into previous unsuccessful planning applications for the future hospital. It further agreed to request the Minister for Infrastructure to provide a breakdown of the cost of the previous planning applications for the future hospital and the subsequent appeals process, including lawyers' fees. It determined that the Scrutiny Liaison Committee should ask the Chief Executive Officer how conflicts of interest could be resolved within the current organisational structure of the Growth Housing and Environment department, as referenced above.

CT

#### 3. PWC Report on Jersey Care Model

The Review Panel noted an email from the Attorney General, dated 14th May 2020, responding to the Chair's question posed in the States Assembly on 12th May 2020. The Review Panel recalled that the Chair had been seeking to establish whether the Review Panel had a right to view a copy of a draft report by PWC concerning the costs of the Jersey Care Model which had been commissioned by the Health and Community Services Department. The Panel had also asked to view any instructions given to PWC following receipt of the first draft and any subsequent draft. The Attorney

General had replied, in essence, that unless the draft report contained personal data, it should be provided on a confidential basis. The Review Panel agreed that the Chair of the Health and Social Security Panel should repeat her request for the Report.

СТ

#### **Record of Meeting**

#### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 11th June 2020

| Present       | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair<br>Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Mary Le Hegarat<br>Senator Sarah Ferguson   |
|---------------|---|
|               | Deputy Kirsten Morel Deputy Robert Ward   |
| Apologies     |   |
| Absent        |   |
| In attendance | Senator Lyndon Farnham, Deputy Chief Minister and Chair of the Our Hospital Political Oversight Group Deputy Hugh Raymond, Assistant Minister for Health and Social Services Charlie Parker, Chief Executive Officer Caroline Landon, Director General for Health and Community Services Richard Bannister, Interim Project Director Tracy Mourant, Private Secretary to the Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture Sebastian Perez, Business Manager, Office of the Chief Executive  Sammy McKee Committee and Panel Officer Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter   |  |
|---|--|
| Briefing – Tendering process and appointment of Hospital Design and Delivery Partner for 'Our Hospital' Project   |  |
| The Panel received a private briefing and slide presentation from the Deputy Chief Minister and officers regarding the tendering process for the appointment of a Design and Delivery Partner for the Future Hospital. This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35 and a private record was taken. |  |

### **Record of Meeting**

#### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 12th June 2020

| Present       | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair  |
|---------------|--|
|               | Connetable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair   |
|               | Deputy Robert Ward   |
|               | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat   |
| Apologies     | Deputy Kirsten Morel   |
|               | Senator Sarah Ferguson   |
| Absent        |  |
| In attendance | Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer<br>Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer |

| Agenda matter  | Action |
|--|--------|
| Meeting – Future Hospital Delivery Partner Press Release  The Panel met to discuss a press release for the Our Hospital Design and Delivery  Partner 500 Our elivery Limited following the model in the partner of |        |
| Partner, FCC Consultants Limited, following the public announcement by the Government of Jersey.   |        |
| The Panel agreed to first write to the Comptroller and Auditor General to gather her views regarding FCC's ongoing judicial proceedings in Spain that concerned alleged money laundering and corruption in Panama. The Panel expressed concern about the reputational risk to Jersey's finance industry from associations with FCC. It was noted that the Political Oversight Group ('POG') recognised there were possible perception issues about the allegations against FCC and their appointment by the Government of Jersey.  | SM     |
| The Panel also expressed concern about a lack of diversity on the POG and noted that the success of the Our Hospital project had significant implications for the quality of healthcare delivered in Jersey.   |        |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 10th July 2020

| Present                | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair  |           |
|------------------------|--|-----------|
|                        | Connetable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair   |           |
|                        | Senator Sarah Ferguson   |           |
|                        | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat   |           |
|                        | Deputy Kirsten Morel   |           |
|                        | Deputy Robert Ward   |           |
| Apologies              |  |           |
| Absent                 |  |           |
| In attendance          | Senator Lyndon Farnham, Deputy Chief Minister                                  |           |
|                        | Deputy Hugh Raymond, Assistant Minister for Health ar Services                 | nd Social |
|                        | Andy Scate, Group Director, Growth, Housing and Environm                       |           |
|                        | Richard Glover, Head of Planning for Major Projects, Growth, and Environment   | Housing   |
|                        | Richard Bannister, Interim Project Director, Growth, Hou                       | sing and  |
|                        | Environment  | Ü         |
|                        | Ashok Handa, Clinical Director for Our Hospital Project, He Community Services | ealth and |
|                        | Caroline Landon, Director, Health and Community Services                       |           |
|                        | Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer                                       |           |
|                        | Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer                                       |           |
| Agenda Matter          |  | Action    |
| 1. Briefing – Function | nal Brief, Options Appraisal and Site Shortlisting                             |           |
| The Danel received the | Deputy Chief Minister ('the Minister') and Officers for a private              |           |
|                        | of sites for the Future Hospital ('the Hospital'). The briefing                |           |
|                        | the development of the 'Functional Brief' and the Options                      |           |
|                        | ortlisting process. The record of this meeting was classified as               |           |
| 1                      | with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as                          |           |
|                        | ite Exemption Article 26.  |           |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 6th August 2020

| Present   | Present Senator Kristina Moore, Chair  |          |
|---|--|----------|
|   | Connetable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair   |          |
|   | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat   |          |
| Apologies   |  |          |
| Absent  | Deputy Kirsten Morel   |          |
|   | Deputy Robert Ward   |          |
|   | Senator Sarah Ferguson   |          |
| In attendance   | Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer   |          |
|   | Ben Walker, Research and Project Officer   |          |
| Agenda Matter   |  | Action   |
|   |  |          |
| 1. Review of the Prefe  | rred Hospital Site   |          |
| hospital site. The Review date and needed to be re selection process. It was  | a suggested approach to the Panel's review of the preferred Panel noted that its current Terms of Reference were out of evised to address specific matters relating to the hospital site further noted that a new Scoping document would need to ed a budget for the engagement of an Adviser.                     |          |
| The Officer circulated draft Terms of Reference to the Panel, which had been formulated based on the suggested approach to the review. The Panel identified a number of amendments to the Terms of Reference which the Officer was requested to enact. The Officer was asked to circulate the Terms of Reference for Panel approval once amended. |  | SM<br>SM |
| preferred hospital site; or<br>project management exp<br>had been circulated price  | e option of engaging two expert advisers for its review of the ne to review the decision-making process and one to provide pertise. The Panel reviewed the list of potential advisors that or to the meeting and requested the Officer to make initial e level of interest in assisting the Panel with its review. | SM       |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 29th September 2020

| Present                  | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair  |           |
|--------------------------|--|-----------|
|                          | Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair   |           |
|                          | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat   |           |
|                          | Deputy Kirsten Morel   |           |
|                          | Deputy Robert Ward   |           |
| Apologies                | Senator Sarah Ferguson   |           |
| Absent                   |  |           |
| In attendance            | Richard Bannister, Interim Project Director, Growth, Hou Environment           | sing and  |
|                          | Ashok Handa, Clinical Director for Our Hospital Project, He Community Services | ealth and |
|                          | Steve Featherstone, Architectural, Lewelyn Davies                              |           |
|                          | Robert Etchwell, Architectural team, Lewelyn Davis                             |           |
|                          | Peter Thomas, Healthcare Building Associate, Arup                              |           |
|                          | Amy Carroll, Economist, Arup   |           |
|                          | Mark Furlonger, Lead Town Planner  |           |
|                          | Alasdair Fernie, Construction Director, ROC/FCC                                |           |
|                          | John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consulting                                   |           |
|                          | Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus   |           |
|                          | Conor Ellis, Head of Health Strategy and Planning, Archus                      |           |
|                          | Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer                                       |           |
|                          | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer                                      |           |
| Agenda Matter            |  | Action    |
| 1. Future Hospital Rev   | riew Panel Briefing – Technical Briefing 2 re: Final Site                      |           |
| The Panel received a bri | iefing from members of the Our Hospital team together with                     |           |
|                          | Partner Team regarding the Hospital Final Site. This meeting                   |           |
|                          | cordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011                     |           |
|                          | alified Exemption Article 35.  |           |
|                          | •  |           |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 30th September 2020

| Present                  | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair                                  |        |
|--------------------------|--|--------|
|                          | Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair                         |        |
|                          | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat   |        |
|                          | Deputy Kirsten Morel   |        |
|                          | Deputy Robert Ward   |        |
| Apologies                | Senator Sarah Ferguson   |        |
| Absent                   |  |        |
| In attendance            | Citizens Panel Members (anonymous)                             |        |
|                          | John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consulting                   |        |
|                          | Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus                         |        |
|                          | Conor Ellis, Head of Health Strategy and Planning, Archus      |        |
|                          | Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer                       |        |
|                          | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer                      |        |
| Agenda Matter            |  | Action |
| 1. Meeting with memb     | ers of the Future Hospital Citizens Panel                      |        |
|                          |  |        |
|                          | bers of the Citizens Panel to discuss their role in the Future |        |
|                          | agreed establishment of the Citizen's Panel would allow the    |        |
|                          | ughout the process, therefore no members have been named       |        |
|                          | eting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of    |        |
| Information (Jersey) Law | 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.        |        |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 1st October 2020

| Present  Apologies  | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair<br>Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Mary Le Hegarat<br>Deputy Kirsten Morel<br>Deputy Robert Ward<br>Senator Sarah Ferguson   |                    |
|---|---|--------------------|
| Absent  |   |                    |
| In attendance   | Senator Lyndon Farnham, Deputy Chief Minister Deputy Hugh Raymond, Assistant Minister for Health ar Services Richard Bannister, Interim Project Director, Growth, Hou Environment Charlie Parker, Chief Executive, Government of Jersey Ashok Handa, Clinical Director for Our Hospital Project, He Community Services Caroline Landon, Director General, Health and Community John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consulting Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus Conor Ellis, Head of Health Strategy and Planning, Archus Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer | sing and ealth and |
| Agenda Matter   |   | Action             |
| 1. Future Hospital Review Panel Briefing on Final Site  The Panel received a briefing from Deputy Chief Minister, Senator L Farnham, and the Our Hospital Team regarding the Hospital Final Site. This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. |   |                    |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 12th October 2020

| Present   | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair                             |        |
|---|---|--------|
|   | Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair                    |        |
|   | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat                                    |        |
|   | Deputy Kirsten Morel                                      |        |
|   | Deputy Robert Ward  |        |
| Apologies   | Senator Sarah Ferguson                                    |        |
| Absent  |   |        |
|   |   |        |
| In attendance   | John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consulting              |        |
|   | Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus                    |        |
|   | Conor Ellis, Head of Health Strategy and Planning, Archus |        |
|   |   |        |
|   | Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer                  |        |
|   | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer                 | 1      |
| Agenda Matter   |   | Action |
| 1. Future Hospital Rev  | riew Panel – Meeting with Advisors                        |        |
| The Panel met with its advisors via Microsoft Teams to discuss the Question Plan prior to the Public Hearing with the Deputy Chief Minister, which was due to take place on 13th October 2020.  |   |        |
| The Panel explained the structure of a Public Hearing and discussed each of the sections within the question plan. It was agreed the advisors would focus on questions regarding technical detail. However, it was also agreed that if they wished to ask any other questions during the Hearing that they would use the chat function within Teams and the Chair would invite them to raise their query. |   |        |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 13th October 2020

| Present                   | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair                               |           |
|---------------------------|---|-----------|
|                           | Connetable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair                      |           |
|                           | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat                                      |           |
|                           | Deputy Kirsten Morel  |           |
|                           | Deputy Robert Ward  |           |
| Apologies                 | Senator Sarah Ferguson                                      |           |
| Absent                    |   |           |
| In attendance             | Senator Lyndon Farnham, Deputy Chief Minister               |           |
|                           | Deputy Richard Renouf, The Minister for Health and Social S |           |
|                           | Deputy Hugh Raymond of Trinity, Assistant Minister for He   | ealth and |
|                           | Social Services   |           |
|                           | Charlie Parker, Chief Executive                             |           |
|                           | Caroline Landon, Director General, Health and Community     | Services  |
|                           | Ashok Handa, Clinical Director, Our Hospital                |           |
|                           | Richard Bannister, Development Director, Our Hospital       |           |
|                           | Joanne Larkin, Head of Finance Business Partnering, Our H   | iospitai  |
|                           | John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consultancy               |           |
|                           | Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus                      |           |
|                           | Conor Ellis, Head of Health Strategy, Archus                |           |
|                           | Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer                    |           |
|                           | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer                   |           |
| Agenda Matter             |   | Action    |
| 1. Public Hearing – Fu    | ıture Hospital Review Panel                                 |           |
|                           |   |           |
|                           | ne Deputy Chief Minister to a public hearing on the Future  |           |
| Hospital Preterred Site ( | Option. The hearing was recorded and transcribed.           |           |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 19th October 2020

| <b>.</b>   |  |        |
|--|--|--------|
| Present  | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair  |        |
|  | Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair   |        |
|  | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat   |        |
|  | Deputy Robert Ward   |        |
| Apologies  | Senator Sarah Ferguson   |        |
|  | Deputy Kirsten Morel   |        |
| Absent   |  |        |
| In attendance  | John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consultancy  |        |
|  | Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus   |        |
|  | Conor Ellis, Head of Health Strategy, Archus   |        |
|  | Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer   |        |
|  | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer  |        |
| Agenda Matter  |  | Action |
| 1. Panel meeting with  | Advisors   |        |
| report. The Panel was i report which would help the key areas they would concern the advisors should be advisored by the second of the panel was in the panel w | dvisors via Microsoft Teams to discuss the layout of the their nformed that the advisors were currently drafting heads of inform the structure of the final report. They also explained I focus on and asked if the Panel had any additional areas of ould consider. The Panel stated its concerns surrounding the the advisors could give particular scrutiny to this area. |        |
|  | with the proposed layout of the advisor's report and it was circulated at the end of October with a final version at the   |        |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 2nd November 2020

| Present  Apologies   | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair<br>Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair<br>Deputy Mary Le Hegarat<br>Deputy Robert Ward<br>Deputy Kirsten Morel<br>Deputy Inna Gardiner  |        |
|--|--|--------|
| Absent   |  |        |
| In attendance  | John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consultancy Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus Conor Ellis, Head of Health Strategy, Archus Sammy McKee, Committee and Panel Officer Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer |        |
| Agenda Matter  |  | Action |
| 1. Panel meeting with  | Advisors   |        |
| The Panel met with its a report.   | dvisors via Microsoft Teams to discuss the first draft of their  |        |
| The advisors explained the structure of the report and the content and it was agreed these were in line with the Panel's Terms of Reference. The Panel asked if reference could be made to the rescindment of the site in Gloucester Street and if the report could be expanded slightly to incorporate this. The advisors agreed they could insert an additional paragraph to reflect this. |  |        |
| The Panel thanked the a the final version.   | dvisors for their draft report and looked forward to receiving   |        |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 6th November 2020

| Present   | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair             |        |
|---|---|--------|
|   | Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair    |        |
|   | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat                    |        |
|   | Deputy Robert Ward                        |        |
|   | Deputy Kirsten Morel                      |        |
|   | Deputy Inna Gardiner                      |        |
| Apologies   |   |        |
| Absent  |   |        |
|   |   |        |
| In attendance   | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer |        |
| Agenda Matter   |   | Action |
| 1. Panel meeting to ap  | prove Report                              |        |
| The Panel met via Micros  | soft Teams to discuss its final report.   |        |
| The Panel reviewed its findings and recommendations and the main body of the report and identified a number of minor amendments which the Officer was requested to enact. The Panel approved its report pending these amendments. |   | JH     |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 16th November 2020

| Dunganat  | Canatas Kristina Maara Chair  |        |
|---|---|--------|
| Present   | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair<br>Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair   |        |
|   | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat  |        |
|   | Deputy Robert Ward  |        |
|   | Deputy Kirsten Morel  |        |
|   | Deputy Inna Gardiner  |        |
| Apologies   |   |        |
| Absent  |   |        |
| In attendance   | John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consultancy   |        |
| in attendance   | Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus  |        |
|   | Conor Ellis, Head of Health Strategy, Archus  |        |
|   |   |        |
|   | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer   |        |
| Agenda Matter   |   | Action |
| 1. Panel meeting with   | advisors to discuss Panel amendment   |        |
|   |   |        |
|   | s advisors via Microsoft Teams to discuss its proposed 20 Our Hospital Site Selection - Overdale.   |        |
| some assurance to the sprovide some level of de being presented. The acadvised the Panel on the optimism bias figure of the some assurance to the sprovide some level of the sprovide | d that, should its amendment be accepted, it would likely give States Assembly that the Council of Ministers would have to tail around costings prior to the Strategic Outline Case (SOC) dvisors explained the technical detail of the amendment and he key areas. The Panel asked if the advisors believed the 18% was feasible and was informed that without the level of the SOC, it was difficult to tell. |        |
| The Panel informed its advisors that the Council of Ministers were proposing an amendment to the Panel's amendment however, it was not aware of the detail as it had not yet been lodged. The advisors informed the Panel they would provide comments on the amendment to the amendment, should the Panel wish.   |   |        |
| The Panel thanked the a   | dvisors for their time.   |        |

#### **Record of Meeting**

#### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 30th November 2020

| Senator Kristina Moore, Chair                 |  |
|---|--|
| Deputy Mary Le Hegarat                        |  |
| Deputy Kirsten Morel                          |  |
| Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair        |  |
| Deputy Robert Ward                            |  |
| Deputy Inna Gardiner                          |  |
|   |  |
| John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consultancy |  |
| Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus        |  |
|   |  |
| Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer     |  |
|   | Action   |
|   | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat Deputy Kirsten Morel Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair Deputy Robert Ward Deputy Inna Gardiner  John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consultancy Richard Darch, Chief Executive, Archus |

#### 1. Panel meeting with advisors to discuss possible next steps for the review

The Panel met with its advisors via Microsoft Teams to discuss the next stage of the Future Hospital review.

The Panel asked if it would be possible for the advisors to undertake an additional, separate piece of work which would show the cost of building a hospital on each of the 9 deselected sites, as referenced within their report. The Panel explained it was seeking cost comparisons with Overdale and Peoples Park versus the 9 deselected sites.

The advisors explained this would involve a relatively large piece of detailed work to ensure the costs they provided were credible. They went on to explain if the work was not undertaken comprehensively it would be likely open to criticism. The advisors queried what the Panel would be looking to achieve considering the site had now been chosen and approved by the assembly.

The Panel explained there was still a lot of public discontent with the chosen site and it wanted to rule out the possibility of an alternative site at a reduced price.

The Panel was advised another option that could be pursued would be to work with the Government of Jersey to ensure the project stayed on course and within budget. This would involve the undertaking of an independent audit process. The advisors made reference to their paper 'Our Hospital Project: Forward Looking Recommendations' which was sent to the Panel on 5th November 2020 and recommended that an independent audit process be undertaken on the Future Hospital Project to ensure that it was following HM Treasury Green Book standards.

It was agreed the advisors would provide a cost to the Panel to design a template covering the specific areas that would be required for the internal audit. This could then be sent to external advisors who were expert in this field as part of the Scrutiny tendering process.

The Panel asked what the next steps could be with regards to its amendment to P.123/2020. The advisors explained the essence of the amendment was around having checks and balances and an independent audit process would assist with this. The advisors discussed documentation from HM Treasury regarding large government projects and infrastructure reviews to enable projects to be interrogated. It was agreed the advisors would send this information to the officer for onward distribution to the Panel.

JΗ

The Panel thanked the advisors for their time and the meeting was closed.

#### **Record of Meeting**

#### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 8th December 2020

| Present       | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair   |
|---------------|---|
|               | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat  |
|               | Deputy Robert Ward  |
|               | Connétable Simon Crowcroft  |
| Apologies     | Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair  |
|               | Deputy Inna Gardiner  |
| Absent        |   |
| In attendance | Kellie Boydens, Principal Committee and Panel Officer Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer |

#### Agenda Matter Action

#### 1. Panel meeting to discuss possible next steps for the review

The Chair welcomed Connétable Crowcroft as a new member to the Panel.

The Panel discussed the report due from CoM in response to P.167-2020 - Our Hospital Preferred Access Route to Overdale – Second Amendment and noted it was due to receive a briefing from the OH Team regarding the upcoming report on Friday 11th December.

The Panel discussed its options should it wish to undertake a review following receipt of more information following the briefing. The Panel noted the second amendment was based around CoM finding suitable alternative access options using sustainable transport and was concerned that this may not be fully addressed within the forthcoming report. The Panel agreed that, based upon the information due to be provided at the upcoming briefing, it could base a review around appraising the options being brought forward to the States for debate. The Panel also discussed the proposed reduced lodging period that was being anticipated with the intention of debating the proposition on 21st December at a special requisitioned sitting of the States, however, this had not yet been confirmed.

The Panel discussed the option of appointing external advisers to assist with a possible review and asked if the officers could contact advisers to ascertain availability. The Panel was advised that it may be difficult to engage advisors with the limited information available and within the tight timeframe. Depending on how many potential advisors were interested in the work, the Panel was also advised that a full tendering process may be required.

The Panel noted the tight timescale in which to undertake a review and to appoint an advisor but stressed that it was keen to get something in place, should it confirm a review following the briefing. In that regard, the Panel requested the officers to send P.167-2020 - Our Hospital Preferred Access Route to Overdale – Second Amendment to potential advisers and enquire if they would be available at short notice to undertake a review into appraising the possible options, once they were proposed by CoM.

JH

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 11th December 2020

| Present  | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair   |        |  |  |
|--|---|--------|--|--|
|  | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat  |        |  |  |
|  | Deputy Robert Ward  |        |  |  |
|  | Connétable Simon Crowcroft  |        |  |  |
| Apologies  | Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair  |        |  |  |
|  | Deputy Inna Gardiner  |        |  |  |
| Absent   |   |        |  |  |
| In attendance  | Deputy Hugh Raymond – Deputy Chair, OH Political Oversight Group, Richard Bannister - Interim Project Director, Growth, Housing and Environment Charlie Parker – Chief Executive, Government of Jersey Andy Scate – Group Director, Regulation, Planning and Environment Jessica Hardwick – Client Project Manager, Transport and Technical Services Alex Welch – Design and Delivery Partner - Arup Sebastian Perez – Business Manager, Chief Ministers Department |        |  |  |
|  | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer   |        |  |  |
| Agenda Matter  |   | Action |  |  |
| Panel briefing with<br>Overdale  | OH Team to discuss the Preferred Access Route to  |        |  |  |
| The Panel received a briefing from the Deputy Chair of the Political Oversight Group,  |   |        |  |  |
| OH Group and members of the OH Team regarding the Preferred Access Route to Overdale. This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of |   |        |  |  |
| Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35.   |   |        |  |  |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 18th December 2020

| Present   | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair                        |        |  |  |
|---|--|--------|--|--|
|   | Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair               |        |  |  |
|   | Deputy Inna Gardiner                                 |        |  |  |
|   | Connétable Simon Crowcroft                           |        |  |  |
| Apologies   | Deputy Robert Ward                                   |        |  |  |
|   | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat                               |        |  |  |
| Absent  |  |        |  |  |
| In attendance   | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer            |        |  |  |
| Agenda Matter   |  | Action |  |  |
| 1. Panel meeting to ap  | prove review into Preferred Access Route to Overdale |        |  |  |
| The Panel approved its Terms of Reference, Scoping Document and Engagement Brief for its review into the Preferred Access Route to Overdale.  The Panel noted it had not received a response from the Chief Minister with regards to its letter dated 15th December requesting a delay to the debate of P.167/2020 Our Hospital: Preferred Access Route to Overdale. The Panel also noted that it had not received confirmation that the debate on P.167/2020 would take place at a requisitioned sitting on 21st December, as previously informed at an earlier briefing. The Panel agreed that on this basis, it would work towards the debate date of 9th February 2021 as specified on the States Assembly website. |  |        |  |  |
| The Panel was informed that a draft outline of the review together with P.167/2020, had been sent to potential advisers. A number of responses had been received and of those contacted, two had expressed an interest. The Panel requested that the full Engagement Brief was sent to the advisers and agreed that a meeting should be arranged with them separately for Monday 21st December via Microsoft Teams to discuss the review in more detail.  |  |        |  |  |

### **Record of Meeting**

### Meeting held by video conference

Date: 21st December 2020

| Present   | Senator Kristina Moore, Chair                                    |        |  |
|---|--|--------|--|
|   | Connétable Michael Jackson, Vice-Chair                           |        |  |
|   | Deputy Mary Le Hegarat   |        |  |
|   | Deputy Inna Gardiner   |        |  |
|   | Connétable Simon Crowcroft                                       |        |  |
| Apologies   | Deputy Robert Ward   |        |  |
| Absent  |  |        |  |
| In attendance   | John Setra, Managing Director, K2 Consultancy                    |        |  |
|   | Janice Hales, Committee and Panel Officer                        |        |  |
| Agenda Matter   |  | Action |  |
| Panel meeting with Access Route to Or   | h potential advisers to discuss review into Preferred<br>verdale |        |  |
| The Panel met with a potential adviser via Microsoft Teams to discuss its review into the Preferred Access Route to Overdale. This meeting was held in private in accordance with the Freedom of Information (Jersey) Law 2011 (as amended) under Qualified Exemption Article 35. |  |        |  |